

Equal Justice Foundation

2018 Colorado Judicial Performance Evaluations

EJF Evaluations Based On Attorney Judgments

| 2018 Judicial Performance Commission Evaluation | | | | | | 2018 EJF Evaluation Based on Attorney Votes |
|---|-----------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|----------------------|---|
| Judge | Finding | Attorney Votes | | Prior Rating | | |
| | | Retain | Do Not Retain | Attorney % Retain | | |
| Colorado Supreme Court | | | | | | |
| Richard L. Gabriel | Meets Standards | 98% | 2% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Colorado Court of Appeals | | | | | | |
| CoA Judges | | | | Prior 2010 | | 2018 |
| John Daniel Dailey | Meets Standards | 79% | 3% | 84% | No Opinion | Marginal |
| Rebecca Rankin Freyre | Meets Standards | 82% | 9% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Elizabeth L. Harris | Meets Standards | 65% | 12% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| David J. Richman | Meets Standards | 88% | 12% | 65% | No Opinion | Retain |
| First Judicial District Judges (Gilpin, Jefferson) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Christie A. Bachmeyer | Meets Standards | 79% | 15% | 90% | Retain | Marginal |
| Diego G. Hunt | Meets Standards | 89% | 4% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Laura A. Tighe | Meets Standards | 53% | 44% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| Gilpin County | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| David C. Taylor | Meets Standards | Insufficient data | | Not on bench | | No Opinion |
| Jefferson County | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Susan Lori Fisch | Meets Standards | 95% | 0% | 85% | Marginal | Retain |
| Mark Marrow Randall | Meets Standards | 87% | N/A | 70% | Do Not Retain | Retain |
| Ryan James Stuart | Meets Standards | 91% | 6% | 79% | Marginal | Retain |
| Thomas Vance | Meets Standards | 90% | 3% | 89% | Retain | Retain |
| Jean Woodford | Meets Standards | 79% | N/A | 71% | Do Not Retain | Marginal |
| <p>Criteria: Retain >85% of attorneys, Marginal 71-85% of attorneys, Do Not Retain <=70% of attorneys Do Not Retain. All judges first stand for retention two years after their appointment or promotion. Retention intervals: Supreme Court — 10 years; Court of Appeals — 8 years; District — 6 years; County — 4 years. Copies of this report are available at http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf.</p> | | | | | | |

| 2018 Judicial Performance Commission Evaluation | | | | | | 2018 EJF Evaluation Based on Attorney Votes |
|--|-----------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|---------------|---|
| Judge | Finding | Attorney Votes | | Prior Rating | | |
| | | Retain | Do Not Retain | Attorney % Retain | | |
| Second Judicial District Judges (Denver County) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Shelley I. Gilman | Meets Standards | 90% | 5% | 93% | Retain | Retain |
| David H. Goldberg | Meets Standards | 94% | 6% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Jay Sutherland Grant | Meets Standards | 95% | 5% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Morris B. Hoffman | Meets Standards | 87% | 10% | 92% | Retain | Retain |
| Kenneth Martin Laff | Meets Standards | 87% | 13% | 81% | Marginal | Retain |
| Catherine A. Lemon | Meets Standards | 67% | 24% | 88% | Retain | Do Not Retain |
| Jennifer B. Torrington | Meets Standards | 70% | 20% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| Denver County Judges | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Johnny C. Barajas | Meets Standards | 88% | 12% | 80% | Marginal | Questionable ethics |
| Brian Thomas Campbell | Meets Standards | 97% | 0% | 81% | Marginal | Retain |
| Andrea Eddy | Meets Standards | 92% | 0% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Adam J. Espinosa | Meets Standards | 82% | 9% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Olympia Z. Fay | Meets Standards | 90% | 4% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Clarisse M. Gonzales | Meets Standards | 82% | 18% | 93% | Retain | Marginal |
| Kerri Lombardi | Meets Standards | 79% | 18% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Chelsea Malone | Meets Standards | Insufficient data | | Not on bench | | No Opinion |
| Third Judicial District Judges (Huerfano, Las Animas) | | | | | | |
| No District or County Court Judges standing for retention. | | | | | | |
| Fourth Judicial District Judges (El Paso, Teller) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Eric Bentley | Meets Standards | 86% | 11% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Linda M. Billings-Vela | Meets Standards | 94% | N/A | 89% | Retain | Retain |
| Jill M. Brady | Meets Standards | 84% | N/A | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Robert L. Lowrey | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | 96% | Retain | Retain |
| Timothy Schutz | Meets Standards | 79% | 13% | 85% | Marginal | Marginal |
| Larry Edward Schwartz | Meets Standards | 92% | 8% | 95% | Retain | Retain |
| Scott A. Sells | Meets Standards | 81% | 10% | 94% | Retain | Marginal |
| Criteria: Retain >85% of attorneys, Marginal 71-85% of attorneys, Do Not Retain <=70% of attorneys Do Not Retain. All judges first stand for retention two years after their appointment or promotion. Retention intervals: Supreme Court — 10 years; Court of Appeals — 8 years; District — 6 years; County — 4 years. Copies of this report are available at http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf. | | | | | | |

| 2018 Judicial Performance Commission Evaluation | | | | | | 2018 EJF Evaluation Based on Attorney Votes |
|--|--------------------------|----------------|---------------|-------------------|---------------|---|
| Judge | Finding | Attorney Votes | | Prior Rating | | |
| | | Retain | Do Not Retain | Attorney % Retain | | |
| Fourth Judicial District Judges (continued) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| David L. Shakes | Meets Standards | 79% | 10% | 89% | Retain | Marginal |
| El Paso County Judges | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Christopher Ed Acker | Does NOT Meets Standards | 62% | N/A | 64% | Do Not Retain | Do Not Retain |
| Lawrence D. Martin | Meets Standards | 90% | 10% | 87% | Retain | Retain |
| Douglas J. Miles | Meets Standards | 86% | N/A | 83% | Marginal | Retain |
| Ann M. Rotolo | Meets Standards | 73% | 14% | 70% | Do Not Retain | Marginal |
| Teller County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Theresa L. Kilgore | Meets Standards | 64% | 36% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| Fifth Judicial District Judges (Clear Creek, Eagle, Lake, Summit) | | | | | | |
| No District Court or County Court Judges standing for retention. | | | | | | |
| Sixth Judicial District Judges (Archuleta, La Plata, San Juan) | | | | | | |
| No District Court Judges standing for retention. | | | | | | |
| Archuleta County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Justin P. Fay | Meets Standards | 86% | 0% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| No county court judges are standing for retention in La Plata or San Juan Counties | | | | | | |
| Seventh Judicial District Judges (Delta, Gunnison, Hinsdale, Montrose, Ouray, San Miguel) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Steven L. Schultz | Meets Standards | 95% | 5% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Keri A. Yoder | Meets Standards | 87% | 9% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Montrose County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Ben A Morris | Meets Standards | 77% | 23% | 62% | Do Not Retain | Marginal |
| San Miguel County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Susanne J. Ross | Meets Standards | 33% | 17% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| No county court judges standing for retention in Delta, Gunnison, Hinsdale, or Ouray counties | | | | | | |
| <p>Criteria: Retain >85% of attorneys, Marginal 71-85% of attorneys, Do Not Retain <=70% of attorneys Do Not Retain. All judges first stand for retention two years after their appointment or promotion. Retention intervals: Supreme Court — 10 years; Court of Appeals — 8 years; District — 6 years; County — 4 years. Copies of this report are available at http://dymen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf.</p> | | | | | | |

| 2018 Judicial Performance Commission Evaluation | | | | | | 2018 EJF Evaluation Based on Attorney Votes |
|---|-----------------|----------------|---------------|-------------------|----------|---|
| Judge | Finding | Attorney Votes | | Prior Rating | | |
| | | Retain | Do Not Retain | Attorney % Retain | | |
| Eighth Judicial District Judges (Jackson, Larimer) | | | | | | |
| No District Court Judges standing for retention. | | | | | | |
| Jackson County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Cindy Wilson | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | 80% | Marginal | Retain |
| Larimer County Judges | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Thomas L. Lynch | Meets Standards | 92% | 8% | 92% | Retain | Retain |
| Peter E. Schoon Jr. | Meets Standards | 71% | 21% | 79% | Marginal | Do Not Retain |
| Ninth Judicial District Judges (Garfield, Pitkin, Rio Blanco) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| James Berkley Boyd | Meets Standards | 84% | 9% | 94% | Retain | Marginal |
| Anne K. Norrdin | Meets Standards | 83% | 6% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Christopher G. Seldin | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Garfield County Judges | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Paul H. Metzger | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | 96% | Retain | Retain |
| Jonathan B. Pototsky | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | 94% | Retain | Retain |
| Pitkin County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Erin Fernandez-Ely | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | 91% | Retain | Retain |
| Rio Blanco County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Laurie A. Noble | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | 88% | Retain | Retain |
| Tenth Judicial District Judges (Pueblo) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Deborah Eyler | Meets Standards | 84% | 16% | 90% | Retain | Marginal |
| Kim Karn | Meets Standards | 93% | 7% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Pueblo County Judges | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Steven B. Fieldman | Meets Standards | 97% | 3% | 84% | Marginal | Retain |
| David Lee Lobato | Meets Standards | 87% | 7% | 94% | Retain | Retain |
| <p>Criteria: Retain >85% of attorneys, Marginal 71-85% of attorneys, Do Not Retain <=70% of attorneys Do Not Retain. All judges first stand for retention two years after their appointment or promotion. Retention intervals: Supreme Court — 10 years; Court of Appeals — 8 years; District — 6 years; County — 4 years. Copies of this report are available at http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf.</p> | | | | | | |

| 2018 Judicial Performance Commission Evaluation | | | | | | 2018 EJF Evaluation Based on Attorney Votes |
|--|-----------------|----------------|---------------|-------------------|----------------------|---|
| Judge | Finding | Attorney Votes | | Prior Rating | | |
| | | Retain | Do Not Retain | Attorney % Retain | | |
| Eleventh Judicial District Judges (Chaffee, Custer, Fremont, Park) | | | | | | |
| District Court judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Ramsey Lama | Meets Standards | 84% | 11% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Lynette M. Wenner | Meets Standards | 71% | 21% | Not on bench | | Sub-Marginal |
| Custer County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Amanda Jean Hunter | Meets Standards | 67% | 33% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| Park County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Brian L. Green | Meets Standards | 70% | 20% | 84% | Marginal | Do Not Retain |
| No county court judges standing for retention in Chaffee or Fremont counties | | | | | | |
| Twelfth Judicial District Judges (Alamosa, Conejos, Costilla, Mineral, Rio Grande, Saguache) | | | | | | |
| District Judge | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Pattie P. Swift | Meets Standard | 100% | 0% | 83% | Marginal | Retain |
| Alamosa County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Daniel A. Walzl | Meets Standards | 80% | 13% | 69% | Do Not Retain | Marginal ? |
| Costilla County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Kimberly L. Wood | Meets Standards | 71% | 18% | 52% | Do Not Retain | Sub-Marginal |
| Rio Grande County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Barbara A. Zollars | Meets Standards | 88% | 6% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Saguache County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Anna Ulrich | Meets Standards | 67% | 33% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| Thirteenth Judicial District Judges (Kit Carson, Logan, Morgan, Phillips, Sedgwick, Washington, Yuma) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Charles M. Hobbs | Meets Standards | 83% | 8% | 95% | Retain | Marginal |
| Carl S. McGuire, III | Meets Standards | 94% | 0% | 96% | Retain | Retain |
| Michael K. Singer | Meets Standards | 91% | 9% | 86% | Retain | Retain |
| Criteria: Retain >85% of attorneys, Marginal 71-85% of attorneys, Do Not Retain <=70% of attorneys Do Not Retain. All judges first stand for retention two years after their appointment or promotion. Retention intervals: Supreme Court — 10 years; Court of Appeals — 8 years; District — 6 years; County — 4 years. Copies of this report are available at http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf. | | | | | | |

| 2018 Judicial Performance Commission Evaluation | | | | | | 2018 EJF Evaluation Based on Attorney Votes | |
|---|-----------------|----------------|---------------|-------------------|-------------------|---|-------------|
| Judge | Finding | Attorney Votes | | Prior Rating | | | |
| | | Retain | Do Not Retain | Attorney % Retain | | | |
| Thirteenth Judicial District County Judges (continued) | | | | | | | |
| Kit Carson County Judge | | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Michael K. Grinnan | Meets Standards | 94% | 6% | 94% | Retain | Retain | |
| Washington County Judge | | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Kelly S. Hansen | Meets Standards | Only two votes | | Not on bench | | Insufficient data | |
| No county court judges standing for retention in Logan, Morgan, Phillips, Sedgwick, or Yuma counties | | | | | | | |
| Fourteenth Judicial District Judges (Grand, Moffat, Routt) | | | | | | | |
| District Judge | | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Michael A. O'Hara III | Meets Standards | 67% | 19% | 85% | Marginal | Do Not Retain | |
| Grand County Judge | | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Nicholas Catanzarite | Meets Standards | 70% | 30% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain | |
| Moffat County Judge | | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Sandra H. Gardner | Meets Standards | 79% | 11% | 93% | Retain | Marginal | |
| Routt County Judge | | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| James H. Garrecht | Meets Standards | 85% | 5% | 92% | Retain | Marginal | |
| Fifteenth Judicial District Judges (Baca, Cheyenne, Kiowa, Prowers) | | | | | | | |
| District Judge | | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Michael Davidson | Meets Standards | 86% | N/A | Not on bench | | Retain | |
| Baca County Judge | | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Debra M. Gunkel | Meets Standards | 33% | 33% | 91% | Retain | Do Not Retain | |
| Cheyenne County Judge | | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Gerald Keefe | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | 100% | Retain | Retain | |
| Kiowa County Judge | | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Gary W. Davis | Meets Standards | 50% | 50% | 67% | Do Not Retain | Do Not Retain | |
| Prowers County Judge | | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Curtis Lane Porter | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | Not on bench | | Retain | |
| <p>Criteria: Retain >85% of attorneys, Marginal 71-85% of attorneys, Do Not Retain <=70% of attorneys Do Not Retain. All judges first stand for retention two years after their appointment or promotion. Retention intervals: Supreme Court — 10 years; Court of Appeals — 8 years; District — 6 years; County — 4 years. Copies of this report are available at http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf.</p> | | | | | | | |

| 2018 Judicial Performance Commission Evaluation | | | | | | 2018 EJF Evaluation Based on Attorney Votes |
|--|--------------------------------|----------------|---------------|-------------------|----------------------|---|
| Judge | Finding | Attorney Votes | | Prior Rating | | |
| | | Retain | Do Not Retain | Attorney % Retain | | |
| Sixteenth Judicial District Judges (Bent, Crowley, Otero) | | | | | | |
| No District Court Judges standing for retention in 2018. | | | | | | |
| Otero County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Douglas R. Manley | Meets Standards | 86% | 9% | 82% | Marginal | Retain |
| No county judges seeking retention in Bent and Crowley Counties | | | | | | |
| Seventeenth Judicial District Judges (Adams, Broomfield) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Jaclyn Brown | Meets Standards | 97% | 3% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Sharon D. Holbrook | Meets Standards | 100% | 0% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Edward C. Moss | Meets Standards | 76% | 21% | 83% | Marginal | Marginal |
| Donald S. Quick | Meets Standards | 76% | 16% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Adams County Judges | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Brian N. Bowen | Meets Standards | 73% | 16% | 65% | Do Not Retain | Marginal |
| Michael A. Cox | Meets Standards | 80% | 20% | 93% | Retain | Marginal |
| Cindy Dang | Meets Standards | 19% | 65% | Not on bench | | Do Not retain |
| Brian L. Howell | Meets Standards | 66% | 26% | 58% | Do Not Retain | Do Not Retain |
| Sabino E. Romano | Meets Standards | 96% | 4% | 97% | Retain | Retain |
| Dianna L. Roybal | Meets Standards | 74% | 11% | 44% | Do Not Retain | Sub-Marginal |
| Broomfield County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Amy E. Bockman | Meets Standards | 73% | 18% | 65% | Do Not Retain | Sub-Marginal |
| Eighteenth Judicial District Judges (Arapahoe, Douglas, Elbert, Lincoln) | | | | | | |
| District Court Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Phillip L. Douglass | Does NOT Meet Standards | 44% | 44% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| Patricia Herron | Meets Standards | 85% | 8% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Gary M. Kramer | Meets Standards | 85% | 13% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Ben L. Leutwyler III | Meets Standards | 92% | 0% | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Robert R. Lung | Meets Standards | 88% | 6% | N/A | Promoted 2016 | Retain |
| Bonnie H. McLean | Meets Standards | 85% | 8% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Criteria: Retain >85% of attorneys, Marginal 71-85% of attorneys, Do Not Retain <=70% of attorneys Do Not Retain. All judges first stand for retention two years after their appointment or promotion. Retention intervals: Supreme Court — 10 years; Court of Appeals — 8 years; District — 6 years; County — 4 years. Copies of this report are available at http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf. | | | | | | |

| 2018 Judicial Performance Commission Evaluation | | | | | | 2018 EJF Evaluation Based on Attorney Votes |
|---|-----------------|----------------|---------------|-------------------|----------------------|---|
| Judge | Finding | Attorney Votes | | Prior Rating | | |
| | | Retain | Do Not Retain | Attorney % Retain | | |
| Eighteenth Judicial District Judges (continued) | | | | | | |
| District Court Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Peter F. Michaelson | Meets Standards | 83% | 10% | 89% | Retain | Marginal |
| Michael Spear | Meets Standards | 80% | 13% | 67% | Do Not Retain | Marginal |
| Shay K. Whitaker | Meets Standards | 85% | 4% | Not on bench | | Marginal |
| Arapahoe County Judges (18th Judicial District) | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Colleen Clark | Meets Standards | 63% | 38% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| Kelly A. LaFave | Meets Standards | 53% | 40% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| Michael J. Roche | Meets Standards | 67% | 24% | Not on bench | | Do Not Retain |
| Cheryl Rowles-Stokes | Meets Standards | 45% | 45% | 33% | Do Not Retain | Do Not Retain |
| Douglas County Judges | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Lawrence Bowling | Meets Standards | 96% | 4% | 89% | Retain | Retain |
| Monica J. Gomez | Meets Standards | 86% | 9% | 71% | Do Not Retain | Retain |
| Susanna Meissner-Cutler | Meets Standards | 89% | 6% | 90% | Retain | Retain |
| Elbert County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Palmer L. Boyette | Meets Standards | 93% | 0% | 86% | Retain | Retain |
| Lincoln County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Truston Lee Fisher | Meets Standards | Not given | | 23% | Do Not Retain | Insufficient data |
| Nineteenth Judicial District Judges (Weld) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| James F. Hartmann | Meets Standards | 95% | 2% | 96% | Retain | Retain |
| Todd L. Taylor | Meets Standards | 87% | 13% | 93% | Retain | Retain |
| Weld County Judges | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| John J. Briggs | Meets Standards | 88% | 13% | 77% | Marginal | Retain |
| Michele L. Meyer | Meets Standards | 92% | 8% | 76% | Marginal | Retain |
| Dana Nichols | Meets Standards | 82% | 18% | 62% | Do Not Retain | Marginal |
| Charles S. Unfug | Meets Standards | 78% | 22% | 72% | Do Not Retain | Marginal |
| <p>Criteria: Retain >85% of attorneys, Marginal 71-85% of attorneys, Do Not Retain <=70% of attorneys Do Not Retain. All judges first stand for retention two years after their appointment or promotion. Retention intervals: Supreme Court — 10 years; Court of Appeals — 8 years; District — 6 years; County — 4 years. Copies of this report are available at http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf.</p> | | | | | | |

| 2018 Judicial Performance Commission Evaluation | | | | | | 2018 EJF Evaluation Based on Attorney Votes |
|--|-----------------|----------------|---------------|-------------------|---------------|---|
| Judge | Finding | Attorney Votes | | Prior Rating | | |
| | | Retain | Do Not Retain | Attorney % Retain | | |
| Twentieth Judicial District Judges (Boulder) | | | | | | |
| District Judges | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Thomas Francis Mulvahill | Meets Standards | 77% | N/A | 91% | Retain | Marginal |
| Norma A. Sierra | Meets Standards | 76% | N/A | 70% | Do Not Retain | Marginal |
| Boulder County Judges | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| David Archuleta | Meets Standards | 80% | N/A | 89% | Retain | Marginal |
| Elizabeth Brodsky | Meets Standards | 89% | N/A | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Twenty-First Judicial District Judges (Mesa) | | | | | | |
| District Court Judge | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Lance P. Tembreza | Meets Standards | 94% | N/A | Not on bench | | Retain |
| Mesa County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| Bruce R. Raaum | Meets Standards | 73% | N/A | 71% | Do Not Retain | Sub-Marginal |
| Twenty-Second Judicial District Judges (Dolores, Montezuma) | | | | | | |
| District Court Judge | | | | Prior 2012 | | 2018 |
| Todd J. Plewe | Meets Standards | 88% | N/A | 92% | Retain | Retain |
| Montezuma County Judge | | | | Prior 2014 | | 2018 |
| JenniLynn Lawrence | Meets Standards | 71% | N/A | 76% | Marginal | Sub-Marginal |
| No county court judges standing for retention in Dolores County | | | | | | |
| <p>Criteria: Retain >85% of attorneys, Marginal 71-85% of attorneys, Do Not Retain <=70% of attorneys Do Not Retain. All judges first stand for retention two years after their appointment or promotion. Retention intervals: Supreme Court — 10 years; Court of Appeals — 8 years; District — 6 years; County — 4 years. Copies of this report are available at http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf.</p> | | | | | | |

Notes

The table above is intended as brief reference to help voters decide how to vote on state judges in their judicial district who are standing for retention in November 2018.

Additional copies of this report are available [on the web](http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018%20Judicial%20Performance%20Evaluations.pdf) at [http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018 Judicial Performance Evaluations.pdf](http://dvmen.org/PDF/2018%20Judicial%20Performance%20Evaluations.pdf).

Our objective with these reports is to support the many outstanding judges who serve Colorado citizens while helping voters decide to eliminate those who are unfit for the position they hold. The basic assumption we've made is that the prosecutors, defense, and civil litigation attorneys know the judges in their judicial district best. They are the ones who deal with the judges on a daily basis and have the education and experience to judge the judges. As a result, the [Equal Justice Foundation](#) evaluation is based entirely on how these attorneys voted on a particular judge; a simple and easily understood metric that is reasonably consistent across the state. In essence, attorneys are a jury of the judge's peers.

The official [judicial performance commission evaluations](#) for state judges dates back to 1990 and they have been posting percentages of attorney votes for and against a judge since 2000. The commissions collect more data than just attorney votes but seldom rule against judges. In 2018, of 128 judges standing for retention, the political appointees of the various commissions only ruled that two of the state's judges did not meet acceptable performance standards. Note that magistrates serve at the pleasure of the chief judge of the judicial district and are not considered state judges and; thus, are not evaluated here.

However, as a general rule, in any large organization it is reasonable to expect that roughly 10% of the individuals in the organization will be incompetent, drunkards, mentally or physically unfit, crooks, or otherwise unsuitable. Of course, sex always rears its lovely head, but copulating with the prosecutor in the judge's chambers, or trying to make a date from the bench with the cutie standing before the bar does exceed the limits of propriety. On the EJF web site in the [Colorado Judges — Citizen's Review](#) chapter we have documented all of those behaviors, and more, by one or more judges. Further, politics, religion, and ideology have no place in a fair and impartial courtroom and a judge's ruling must not be based on emotions and feelings.

If you would like to go sit in a judge's courtroom and form your own opinion we have [courtwatcher forms](#) available that should be of some assistance to you in that endeavor. We link appropriately completed courtwatcher forms to the judge's name on our [web site](#).

The Equal Justice Foundation has been producing these biennial evaluations of Colorado judges since 2012. Thus, it is possible to compare the performance of judges standing for retention in 2018 with their prior evaluations, as has been done in the above table. Of the 42 district judges who stood for retention in 2012, only 21 are standing for retention again. Of the 76 county court judges who stood for retention in 2014, only 53 are standing for retention again in 2018. The others have retired, stepped down, or been removed from the bench for other reasons, as we have attempted to [document](#). Thus, 21 district judge and 23 county judge positions have opened up in the past four to six years. But that count is incomplete and we find 46 judges now standing for retention who were promoted to a state court bench in the past two or three years and are now standing for retention for the first time; a small and not surprising difference.

Of more concern is the large number of judges we do not think should be retained based on attorney appraisals and past history. If we had used the same standards as in 2014, over 40 of the 128 judges would have been found unfit. Even lowering our Do Not Retain standard by 5%, we still suggest that 23 judges who are standing for retention should be voted off the bench. Of the 128 total we also suggest that the performance of an additional 41 judges is marginal at best. We express particular concern for those judges whose past performance was marginal at their previous review and attorneys now rate their performance as worsening, as documented in the table above.

However, the final decision is in the hands of the voters and we hope this document is a useful tool for helping them decide which jurists they want to keep on the bench.

Support

We would be amiss if we did not conclude with a plea for support for our work. The [Equal Justice Foundation](#) is a non-profit 501(c)(3) public charity and contributions are tax deductible. It should be obvious that there are many costs to doing research like this on a continuing basis. However, **the Foundation has no paid employees** so all of your support goes into helping with the research and dissemination of same. We note with pride that during 2017 the research and stories on our web sites was accessed by an average of 2,400 unique visitors a day by people in every state and at least 180 other countries. Our work is also commonly reposted on other sites all around the world as well.

It would be greatly appreciated if you would donate whatever you can [online](#) or by sending a check to the address below. If interested in helping with our work, or joining the Foundation, that can be done [online](#) as well, or by printing and filling out the form [available here](#) and mailing it to the address below together with a check or money order for your dues. Dues are just \$25/year, which are not onerous, and there is strength in numbers.